

BOOK REVIEW 2

Yıldız Deveci Bozkus

Researcher ASAM, Institute for Armenian Research ydeveci@eraren.org

BIG BETRAYAL: ARMENIAN CHURCH AND TERROR, HISTORICAL SEQUENCE

Prof. Dr. Erdal İlter

Ankara: Turhan Kitabevi, 2007, 165 Pages.

r. Erdal İlter, whose book entitled The Bibliography of Turkish-Armenian Relations has been used as a guidebook for those studying Turkish-Armenian Relations, has been interested in Armenian question and has been publishing many books and articles on that issue. Armenian Church and Terror, which has first been published in 1996 in Turkish and in English, and second time in 1999, was published for the third time with some additions.

As known, Armenian Church has always had a national authority on Armenians and played an active role in the formation of Armenian political organizations, i.e. the Armenian state. Therefore this book is quite significant in dealing with the activities of the Armenian church in the late Ottoman Empire as well as the perceptions developed by Lebanon Antilias and Etchmiyadzin Catholicoses regarding Turkey in the aftermath of Lausanne Peace Treaty.

In the first chapter entitled "The Beginning of Ottoman-Armenian Relations", the author examines the situation of Armenians within the Ottoman Empire and their religious groupings. Accordingly, due to their relocation by Byzantines, Armenians perceived the Turks as saviors. İlter argues that Ottoman-Armenian relations can be initiated with the sultanate of Orhan Gazi between 1326-1362. The Armenian population of the Ottoman Empire and Armenian-Turkish relations

are also covered in this chapter and, based particularly on foreign resources, it is argued that Armenians had never constituted a majority in the Eastern Anatolia. Ilter determines Armenian population within the Empire as 1.300.000 shows the data reached by Armenian scholars and supporting this number.

Ilter also argues that since non-Muslims were exempted from conscription they had grown economically and in terms of population continuously. Therefore, they constituted the most prosperous segment of the society due to Ottoman state policies towards non-Muslims. The book includes the perceptions of English, German, Russian and French scholars on Armenians and how they evaluated the Turkish-Armenian Relations. What is more, this section includes a thankful manuscript written by one of the prominent Armenians, Migirdiç Dadyan, stipulating that Armenians lived under full liberty in the Ottoman Empire.

As known, in the emergence of the Armenian question, Ottoman reform and constitutional movements had a significant role. As a result of this reform movement comes Armenian Nation Law, which brings some regulations for the Armenians. Ilter analyses this law in detail. Accordingly, Armenian Patriarchate had been provided with extensive competence and Armenians were granted with the establishment of a general assembly of 140 members. What is more, Armenian Patriarchate would be elected by this assembly, which means that the decisions on the administration of Armenian community could be taken from abroad. İlter argues that non-Muslims benefited from these privileges and had been treated as independent communities: "Armenians, who were benefited from these wide concessions had organized, opened schools and published journals and newspapers. The Patriarchate, which had utilized the Armenian National Law that initiated a new era for the Armenian political and social presence, accelerated its attempts for autonomy through the liberty provided by the aforementioned law. According to Ilter, the issue of Armenian autonomy was first demanded by Mıgırdiç Hırimyan and he dispersed his ideas through two journals entitled the 'Eagle of Van' and the 'Eagle of Mus'. After Hirimyan's election as Patriarch, he aims to direct the attention of Armenian community of Istanbul, the assembly and the government of Armenia.

Another issue covered in the book is the Armenian activities from the proclamation of Ottoman parliamentary government until Mudros Armistice. Accordingly, after the ottoman entry to the World War I Armenian bands began to support Russia through the Armenian Church and some volunteer troops were established to wage a war against the Ottoman Empire in Eastern Anatolia. As a result of these rebellions, Armenians were relocated as a result of Relocation Law of May 27, 1915. The author also touches upon the territorial demands of Boghos Nubar Pasha for independent Armenia and his connections with the representatives of Allied Powers. What is more, he also examines French-Armenian relations and the disappointment of Armenians after French evacuation of Cilicia region and their immigration to Syria, Lebanon, Cyprus and Egypt.

Ilter also argues that with the Lausanne Treaty Armenian question was resolved, at least legally, and with the Treaty, Armenians were perceived as one of the three non-Muslim minorities of Turkish state without any further privilege. Ilter examines Atatürk's perception of the Armenian question as well. He argues that Atatürk took this issue within the general framework of minority question and emphasized the great power intervention on this issue. Accordingly, since Erzurum Congress, Atatürk paid attention to the equality of minorities with that of prospective Turkish citizens of the Turkish state.

In the second part of his book Îlter argues that Armenian relocation is not an ottoman phenomenon but an earlier phenomenon started in the Middle Ages. Accordingly, Armenians were relocated by Greeks, Crusaders, Mongolians, Mamluks, Iranians and Russians and the Armenian diaspora was begun to be formed in these periods. He emphasized socio-economic factors for the Armenian migrations besides political ones. In this section, Îlter focuses on Armenian settlement in Lebanon, their political and religious situation and the Armenian terrorist

organization, ASALA, which had been established in Lebanon. The author also examined the relationship between Lebanese Armenians and Tashnak part as well as Lebanon becoming one of the main centers of Armenian diaspora.

In sum, this book, in which Armenian demands since 19th century and the positions of the countries supporting these demands are covered, includes significant data for understanding Armenian question being one of the main foreign policy issues of Turkey. Among many books written on this issue, İlter's book attracted attention by its fluent style, in-depth analysis, rich resources and the author's experience on the subject matter. Therefore, some Armenians, including Mesrob Kirkorian from Vienna University criticized the book in an unjust manner. Still, these criticisms are significant for the fame of this book abroad.

RECENT PUBLICATIONS

Yıldız Deveci Bozkus

ASAM, Institute for Armenian Research ydeveci@eraren.org

Yaraya Tuz Bastım"Ermeni Soykırımı...

Tuncay Özkan Türkçe 485 sayfa

İstanbul, Detay Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 9944314084

Aggravating the Pain: "The Armenian Genocide...:

Anlatılar ve Fotoğraflarla 1914 Öncesi Ermeni Köy Hayatı

Mary Kilbourne Matossian-Susie Hoogasian Villa

Çev: Altuğ Yılmaz

Türkçe 364 Sayfa

İstanbul, Aras Yayınları, 2006

ISBN: 975-7265-86-1

Armenian Village Life before 1914

Büyük İhanet Ermeni Kilisesi ve Terör-Tarihi Seyir

Erdal İlter

Türkçe

152 Sayfa, 3. Baskı

Ankara, Turhan Kitabevi, 2007 ISBN: 978-9944-265-14-0

High Treason: Armenian Church and Terror - Historical Course

Ermeni Göçü 1834-1915 / Tehcir Öncesi Anadolu'dan Amerika'ya Ermeni Göçü

Ahmet Akter Türkçe 272 Sayfa İstanbul, IQ Yayıncılık, 2007

ISBN:9752551244

Armenian Emigration 1834-1915: Armenian Emigration from Anatolia to America before Relocation

Türk-Ermeni İhtilâfı Makaleler

Hikmet Özdemir Türkçe 624 Sayfa Ankara, TBMM Yayınları, 2007 ISBN: 978-975-6226-29-2

Turkish-Armenian Conflict Articles

Türk-Ermeni İhtilâfı Belgeler

Hikmet Özdemir, Yusuf Sarınay Türkçe 540 Sayfa Ankara, TBMM Yayınları, 2007 ISBN: 978-975-6226-34-6

Turkish-Armenian Conflict Documents

"1915 Tartışılırken Gözden Kaçırılanlar"

Hikmet Özdemir Türkçe 70 Sayfa Ankara, SAREM Yayınları, 2007 ISBN: 978-975-409-446-6

Issues Missed in the 1915 Armenian Debate

Gürcü Devleti'nin Kırmızı Kitabı / Ermeni İddialarına Yanıt

Karibi Türkçe 120 Sayfa İstanbul, Kaynak Yayınları, 2007 ISBN: 975-343-492-8

Red Book of Georgian State / Reply to the Armenian Claims

Tarihi Gerçekler ve Bilimin İşığında Ermeni Sorunu

Bülent Bakar, Necdet Öztürk, Süleyman Beyoğlu Türkçe 544 Sayfa İstanbul, IQ Yayıncılık, 2007

ISBN: 978-975-255-126-8

The Armenian Question in the Light of Historical Facts and Science

Belgeler, Mektuplar ve Resmi Yazışmalarla Türk Soykırımında Fransız Ermeni İlişkileri

Ali Özoğlu

Türkçe

368 Sayfa

İstanbul, Toplumsal Dönüşüm Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 975-908-604-2

French-Armenian Relations in the Turkish Genocide with Documents, Letters and Official Correspondences

Kan Meclisi 1915

Ahmet Şafak

Türkçe

216 Sayfa

İstanbul, Kara Kutu Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 978-975-6054-83-3 The Assembly of Blood 1915

Yaraya Tuz Bastım (2. Baskı)

Tuncay Özkan

Türkçe

484 Sayfa

İstanbul, Detay Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 978-994431408-4

Aggravating the Pain(2nd Ed.)

Hitler ve Ermeni Soykırımı

Kevork B. Bardakjian

Çev: Ali Gelen

Türkçe

İstanbul, Peri Yayınları, 2006

160 Sayfa,

ISBN: 975-90-10-38-0

Hitler and the the Armenian Genocide

Ermeni Mitomanyası

Erich Feigl

Çev: Can Ceylan

Türkçe

167 Sayfa İstanbul, 2007

ISBN: 978-3-85002-583-6 **Armenain Mythomania**

Arşiv Belgeleriyle Ermeni Faaliyetleri 1914-1918 Cilt VI

Dr. Öğretmen Alb. Ahmet Tetik Türkçe, Osmanlıca, İngilizce 557 Sayfa

Ankara, Genelkurmay Başkanlığı Yayınları, 2006

ISBN: 975-409-312-1

Armenian Activities through Archival Documents 1914-1918 Volume VI

Çeşitli Yönlerden Türk-Ermeni İlişkileri

Prof. Dr. Şafak Ural, Prof. Dr. Kazım Yetiş, Prof. Dr. Feridun Emecen Türkçe 522 Sayfa

İstanbul, İstanbul Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2006

ISBN: 975-404-765-0

Turkish-Armenian Relations Assessed by Various Perspectives

Hoşgörü Toplumunda Ermeniler Cilt: I, II, III, IV

Prof. Dr. Metin Hülagü, Yrd. Doç. Dr. Süleyman Demirci Yrd. Doç. Dr. Şakir Batmaz, Yrd. Doç. Dr. Gülbadi Alan Türkçe

I. Cilt: 574, II. Cilt:560, III.Cilt 580, IV. Cilt: 592 Sayfa Kayseri, Erciyes Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2007

ISBN:978-9944-976-10-7

Armenians in the Society of Indulgence Volumes: I, II, III, IV

The Times Gazetesi'ne Göre Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Ermeniler-Rumlar-Yahudiler (1908-1918)

İlay İLERİ Türkçe 453 Sayfa

Ankara, Turhan Kitabevi Yayınları, 2006

ISBN: 975-6194-85-5

The Armenians-Greeks-Jews in the Ottoman Empire according to The Times

II. Abdülhamit Döneminde Orta ve Doğu Karadeniz'de Meydana Gelen Ermeni Olayları

Tuğrul Özcan

Türkçe

135 Sayfa

İstanbul, Akis Kitap Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 994-441-143-4

The Armenain Events in the Middle and East Black Sea Region under the Reign of II. Abdülhamit

Tebe'a-i Sâdıka Ermeniler

Sema Küçüksöz

Türkçe

272 Sayfa

İstanbul, Tek Yayıncılık, 2006

ISBN: 975-7766-97-6

Loyal Subjects: Armenians

Atatürk'ü Anlayamadınız!

Sarkis Terziyan

Türkçe

141 Sayfa

İstanbul, Kardanadam Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 975-915-707-1 Atatürk Not Understood

Türkler Soykırım Yaptı mı?

Gökhan Balcı

Türkçe

233 Sayfa

İstanbul, Truva Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 994-497-584-2

Did the Turks Commit Genocide?

Diaspora Ermenilerinin Soykırım Yalanları ve Mücadele Yöntemlerimiz

Tahir Tamer Kumkale

Türkçe

262 Sayfa

İstanbul, Pegasus Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 978-994-432-660-5

The Genocide Lies of the Armenian Diaspora and Our Combat Strategies

Sözde Ermeni Soykırımı Projesi Toplumsal Bellek ve Sinema

Birsen Karaca

Türkçe

160 Sayfa

İstanbul, Say Yayınları, 2006

ISBN: 975-468-642-4

The So-Called Armenain Genocide Project, Social Memory and Cinema

Rus Devlet Arşivlerinden 100 Belgede Ermeni Meselesi

Mehmet Perinçek

Türkçe

228 Sayfa

İstanbul, Doğan Kitap Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 978-975-293-558-7

The Armenian Case: 100 Documents of Russian State Archives

Bu Dosyayı Kaldırıyorum

Yunus Zeyrek

Türkçe

368 Sayfa

İstanbul, Kum saati Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 978-975-917-937-3

Case Dismissed

İttifak Devletleri Kaynaklarında Ermeni Soykırımı Toplu Makaleler 3

Vahakn N. Dadrian

Türkçe

412 Sayfa

İstanbul, Belge Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 975-344-371-4

Armenain Genocide in References of the Central Powers:

Collective Articles 3

Gördüklerim Yaşadıklarım (Erzurum 1917-1918)

Rus Yarbay (Lt. Col.) Tverdohlebof

Türkçe, İngilizce, Fransızca, Rusça

Ankara, Genelkurmay Askeri Tarih ve Stratejik Etüt Başkanlığı Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 978-975-409-439-8

I Witnessed and Lived Through (Erzurum 1917-1918)

Sultan İkinci Abdülhamid Han'a Yapılan Suikastın Tahkikat Raporu

Türkçe 256 Sayfa İstanbul, Çamlıca Yayınları, 2007

ISBN: 978-994-490-524-4 Inquiry Report of the Sultan Abdülhamid Han II Assasination Attempt

Ermeni İsyanı Günlüğü 1915

Orhan Sakin Türkçe 240 Sayfa İstanbul, Ekim Yayınları, 2007 ISBN: 975-010-910-2

The Armenian Revolt Diary 1915